

PERSPECTIVES

SPECIAL

Decarbonizing portfolios: 10 key factors

Introduction: why decarbonize? Defining the decarbonization objective

Portfolio implementation and management



Contents

Introduction: why decarbonize?	
In summary: key factors and implications	p. 4
Defining the decarbonization objective	р. 5
Factor #1: Emissions measures	p. 5
Factor #2: Time perspective	p.7
Factor #3: Target type	p. 9
Portfolio implementation and management	p. 10
Factor #4: Asset class data	p. 10
Factor #5: Investment vehicles	p. 11
Factor #6: Exclusions	p. 12
Factor #7: Switching	p. 12
Factor #8: Performance	p. 13
Factor #9: Risks	p. 14
Factor #10: Optimization and regulation	p. 15
Conclusion	p. 16
Glossary	p. 17
Important note	p. 18



Introduction



Markus Müller CIO ESG & Global Head of CIO Office



Daniel Sacco Investment Officer EMEA

Why decarbonize?

Global temperatures continue to rise. In response, governments have committed to reducing their economies' global carbon emissions to reach "net zero" emissions by 2050. Economies, governments and corporates are now in a process of transition towards more sustainable, lower carbon-emitting models. This is "decarbonization" – both a process and an outcome.

Investors, for their part, may have several underlying objectives in decarbonizing their portfolio. For example, through investing in firms or sectors with lower actual or projected emissions, they may want to **contribute** to overall process of global decarbonization. They may want to gain from the investment **opportunities** that will emerge in the transition to a low carbon sustainable economy. Or they may believe that decarbonizing a portfolio can mitigate **risks** involved in this transition (through reducing the risk of investing in what might become stranded assets), with implications for long-term portfolio performance.

In this report, we look at key factors involved in decarbonizing a portfolio. We start by discussing why a decarbonization **objective** needs to be carefully defined and the implications of this. We then look at challenges around **portfolio implementation and management** and possible ways to address them. These challenges include data availability, investment vehicles, security selection, optimisation and the two related issues of portfolio performance and risk.

It is worth stating clearly at the start that there is no single perfect agreed metric or method for portfolio decarbonization. Approaches will be adjusted as the transition to a more sustainable economy continues. But we do think it is now possible to identify 10 key factors around decarbonizing portfolios and how to approach them.

This report sets out several of the ways in which portfolios can be decarbonized. We do not assess the real-world impact of different carbon reduction options, or specific investment opportunities created by the transition to a more sustainable economy. Our emphasis here is in taking existing portfolios and decarbonizing them.

The views expressed in this report are those of Deutsche Bank's CIO Office. These are based on internal research as well as inputs from a program of joint discussions between Deutsche Bank and BlackRock's EMEA Investment & Product Solutions and Sustainable Investment Research & Analytics teams. We thank them for their insights.



In summary: key factors and implications

- **1. Emissions measure:** relative emissions measures help select and manage investments in a decarbonization portfolio but reducing absolute emissions levels must be the aim.
- 2. **Time perspective:** carbon emissions measures need to be forward-looking but with progress closely monitored. Decarbonization pathways are key to achieving the endpoint.
- **3. Target type:** binary targets for decarbonization outcomes are complemented by benchmarking of progress and to validate some portfolio components.
- 4. Asset class data: equities and corporate debt data availability means they will be at the heart of a portfolio strategy. Decarbonization data for other asset classes is more challenging.
- **5. Investment vehicles:** choosing between "active" and "passive" investment approaches will involve multiple factors and some potential compromises.
- **6. Exclusions:** not investing at all in specific sectors can be a blunt tool, could affect portfolio performance and be counterproductive in encouraging the sustainability transition.
- 7. Switching: the ability to replace individual investments with others with better decarbonization metrics may be limited by the lack of alternatives and portfolio management considerations.
- 8. **Performance:** screening for decarbonization targets will reduce the investment universe, may skew portfolio composition, hence, some room for flexibility may be advisable.
- **9. Risks:** decarbonization will require different short-term management of financial risks but could help reduce longer-term transition risks, e.g. around stranded assets.
- **10. Optimization and regulation:** portfolios will require ongoing optimization in line with real-world decarbonization and changing regulation.

In Europe, Middle East and Africa as well as in Asia Pacific this material is considered marketing material, but this is not the case in the U.S. No assurance can be given that any forecast or target can be achieved. Forecasts are based on assumptions, estimates, opinions and hypothetical models which may prove to be incorrect. Past performance is not indicative of future returns. Performance refers to a nominal value based on price gains/losses and does not take into account inflation. Inflation will have a negative impact on the purchasing power of this nominal monetary value. Depending on the current level of inflation, this may lead to a real loss in value, even if the nominal performance of the investment is positive. Investments come with risk. The value of an investment can fall as well as rise and you might not get back the amount originally invested at any point in time. Your capital may be a risk. This document was produced in Agust 2024.



Please use the QR code to access a selection of other Deutsche Bank CIO reports. www.deutschewealth.com

Defining the decarbonization objective

Any decarbonization objective needs to be credible and driven by real-world experience rather than accounting priorities. It needs a specified measure that is calculable, a time frame and an anticipated trajectory towards the objective. It must also be considered in the context of the overall process of global decarbonization.

#1

- Relative emissions measures help select and manage investments in a decarbonization portfolio – but reducing absolute emissions levels must be the aim.
- Implication: focus on relative emissions measures.

Emissions measures

Reducing absolute levels of carbon emissions is the portfolio aim, but relative measures are also needed when selecting investments within asset classes. Forward-looking metrics, like implied temperature rise (ITR) provide a way of pulling together emissions measures at a portfolio level.

Ultimately, the aim is to reduce the absolute level of the global economy's carbon emissions. But there are problems with focusing only on an **absolute measure** (i.e. tons CO_2 emitted) at a portfolio level – not least because a larger portfolio will, ceteris paribus, create more emissions.

A more useful focus, therefore, could be on **relative measures** of carbon emissions when you compare firms for investment. But how do you measure "relative"?

One approach is to look at the **carbon footprint** of a firm, defined at the tons CO₂ emitted relative to a given measure. This should make it possible to compare carbon emissions between firms (and thus investments). But the problem is that the usual measure for comparison, a firm's capital value, will be affected by changes in its share price which may be unrelated to completely carbon emissions. (COVID-19, for example, initially pushed down stock markets and thus capital values – so artificially worsening firms' carbon footprints, at a time when the forced reduction of economic activity was in fact resulting in a sharp fall in actual carbon emissions.)

Carbon intensity measures instead the amount of carbon emitted by a firm for each unit of output or revenue. (For most organisations, with a range of different outputs, carbon intensity will be measured relative to revenues.) The appeal of carbon intensity is that it is easy to understand, can be refined further and easily weighted for inclusion in an index of investments. But, again, the measure for comparison (in this case revenues) can be affected by factors unrelated to climate change. Of course both capital value and revenues are



expressed in money terms which means they are subject to inflation and exchange rate movements. But this is a topic for future work when clearer standards emerge.¹

As well as the emissions measure, we also need to define the scope of the emissions that we are measuring. Three different levels are commonly used: **Scope 1** (those from activities owned by the firm), **Scope 2** (from the production of energy, e.g. electricity, which the firm then uses) or **Scope 3** (from other indirect sources of associated with the firm's activities). Deciding on the scope has implications for our ability to forecast emissions, and for potential double-counting (see below).

Three possible portfolio decarbonization measures

Absolute emissions Tons CO ₂ e Firm's total GHG emissions	 Pros Can be used across asset classes Allows portfolio decomposition and attribution analysis Cons Larger portfolios will report larger emissions Lack of normalization limits comparability
Carbon footprint Tons CO ₂ e / market capitalization Firm's total GHG emissions divided by market capitalization	 Pros Allows comparison Allows portfolio decomposition and attribution analysis Cons Changes in market capitalization can be misinterpreted Does not consider size of company operations (carbon efficiency) Equity and fixed income exposures react differently to enterprise value
Carbon efficiency Tons CO ₂ e / revenue Firm's total GHG emissions divided by its revenues	 Pros Captures emissions efficiency for firm's operations Can be used across asset classes Allows portfolio decomposition and attribution analysis Cons Can be skewed by outliers Using revenue measure favours companies with higher pricing levels relative to peers Revenue shocks across specific sectors will have an impact

Source: Deutsche Bank AG, BlackRock. Data as of July 2024.

Measuring carbon emissions – in relative terms – provides a way to choose between investments in individual sectors and, to some extent, between asset classes. A bridge between such measures and understanding investment choices' overall portfolio impact is the concept of **implied temperature rise (ITR)**. The point of ITR is to put companies' projected emissions in the context of an overall aim of reducing the global temperature rises



to 1.5°: in essence, are firms' emissions undershooting or overshooting on what is needed to hold temperature rises down? Calculations on ITR are one component of a range of **science-based targets** (e.g., SBTi) relevant for assessing climate change.

The Paris Agreement and decarbonization

Growing global concern about the dangers posed by climate change led to the 2015 Paris Agreement. This aims to limit global temperature rises to "well below" 2°C above pre-industrial levels – if possible below 1.5°C. To do this, emissions should be reduced, with "net zero" emissions by 2050. To keep on track for the 1.5°C target, it is estimated that emissions need to be halved by 2030.² It is now estimated that 92% of global GDP (at purchasing power parity) is now covered at a country level by net-zero targets.³ Despite these developments, progress on reducing the actual level of carbon emissions has been slow. The Paris Agreement remains a pillar of market progress in setting a clear time horizon for the decarbonization process and for leading a drive for better reporting of carbon emissions.

#2

- Carbon emissions measures need to be forward-looking but with progress closely monitored.
 Decarbonization pathways are key to achieving the endpoint.
- Implication: keep portfolios forward-looking.

Time perspective

Investment should be done on the basis of what we think will happen in the future. Firms' carbon reduction pledges provide an (imperfect) way to do this, if monitored against real world progress. Decarbonization pathways are key to achieving the endpoint.

Once it has been decided what exactly to measure, the next decision is over what time perspective we are measuring it. Are we concerned only about what carbon emissions are now (**actual emissions-based**)? Or are we more interested about what they might be in future (**target-based**)?

Both perspectives are useful. Actual emissions show us the reality of where we are starting from. But, with decarbonization an ongoing and ever-evolving process, we also need to invest based on what we expect will happen in future. Firms' targets for reducing carbon emissions, though imperfect, are probably the best available way to do this. (Although they will require continued monitoring for achievement and credibility.)



	Emission based	Target based
	\rightarrow	$\overline{}$
	Backward-looking	Forward-looking
	 Actual emissions measures, e.g. in terms of carbon footprint or intensity 	 Can aim to meet binary targets, benchmark divergence or implied temperature rise measures
Pro	 Easier to measure Easier to understand Reflects actual emissions 	 Puts focus on companies' emissions targets Avoid sectoral or regional bias inherent in divestment based only on existing emissions Based on and assessable vs. current emissions data
Cons	 Measures only the status quo - does not consider likely future developments So may tilt portfolio to divestment, rather than transformation Divestment results in sectoral or regional bias and lower diversification 	 Reliant on company and investor assumptions and estimates Reliant on investor engagement to make sure targets/measures met Ongoing changes in real world emissions not captured

Backward-vs. forward-looking decarbonization measures

Source: Deutsche Bank AG, BlackRock. Data as of July 2024.

The likely carbon-emission **pathways** towards this long-term objective are relevant. In reality, as Figure 3 illustrates, these are unlikely to be straight lines: an immediate fall in carbon intensity when a portfolio is first adjusted to follow a decarbonization objective (for example, by switching away from high carbon emitters) may well be followed by smaller year-on-year declines.

The likely decarbonization pathway will also be affected by the overall decarbonization of the global economy (e.g. by increased use of renewable energy). We will return to this issue of relative decarbonization as we discuss targets and performance below.



One possible decarbonization pathway

Source: Deutsche Bank AG, BlackRock. Data as of July 2024. For illustrative purposes only.



#3

- Binary targets for decarbonization outcomes are complemented by benchmarking of progress and to validate some portfolio components.
- Implication: benchmarking as well as binary targets needed.

Target type

Portfolios are likely to need both clear binary targets for decarbonization outcomes and ways of benchmarking progress towards achieving these outcomes. Benchmarks may also provide a way of assessing and validating some portfolio components.

Once there is a portfolio objective, a measure and a timeframe, what sort of **target** should we set for the portfolio's decarbonization performance?

Most decarbonization portfolios are likely to have some form of **binary target** – a defined outcome that is either achieved or missed, for example in terms of the implied temperature rise (ITR) for a portfolio. You could also have subsidiary targets of, for example, the percentage shares of portfolio holdings which are committed to net zero outcomes or are science-based target initiative (SBTi)-validated.

Binary targets are relatively easy to understand and, usually, to identify as hit or missed (although calculation of the underlying indicators can be difficult). But they still need to be put in context and given a time horizon. A target-setting protocol and external validation might be relevant as well.

During the lifetime of a portfolio, you may need different ways of assessing progress on decarbonization. One way to do this is to measure the difference between the emissions pathway of an investment holding (or aggregate holdings in a portfolio) and the pathway of a reference benchmark **– benchmark divergence**.

Benchmarks will play a large part in portfolio decarbonization. The Paris Agreement (see Factor #1 above) sets a long-term goal/timeframe for restricting temperature increases. Different benchmark use cases arise from the necessary decarbonization that these temperature limits would imply. For example, you could **target** the amount by which the decarbonization of a portfolio should beat the overall decarbonization of the global economy.

Benchmarks can also be used in a quite different way: to define **minimum standards** for financial products related to decarbonization pathways. Two prominent examples of this would be the European Commission's Climate Transition Benchmark (CTB) and more ambitious Paris Aligned Benchmark (PAB).⁴ The PAB is intended to approximate the path to achieving alignment with a 1.5° temperature rise: if a financial index is to be defined as PAB compliant, it must have a carbon intensity that is initially 50% lower than the parent index, and the carbon intensity of the index must be reduced by 7% each year on average – either through the individual companies in the index reducing their carbon intensity, or through changing the components of the index to reduce carbon intensity.



Benchmarks themselves must be robust, credible and appropriate for the overall portfolio decarbonization objective. Assumptions and methodologies need to be understood and approaches can vary across data providers, posing challenged for a portfolio-level aggregation. Regulation will remain important in defining and setting relevant parameters (see Factor #10 below). Assessing benchmark divergence is discussed in depth in the GFANZ methodology.⁵

Portfolio implementation and management

Multi-asset portfolios require both selection of individual assets and decisions on how to divide assets across different asset classes (asset allocation) based on expected relative asset class returns. In this section, our focus is on **how to select investments to achieve our overall portfolio decarbonization and financial performance objectives** and then **how to manage the resulting portfolio**.

#4

- Equities and corporate debt data availability means they will be at the heart of a portfolio strategy. Decarbonization data for other asset classes is more problematic.
- Implication: Focus approach on available data on equities and corporate debt.

Asset class data

Many equities and corporate credit issuers publish emission commitments and will, therefore, be central to a portfolio decarbonization strategy. There are conceptual problems with calculating emissions for sovereign debt. Data for other asset classes and private markets is rare. The first consideration is the availability of decarbonization data. This varies between asset classes.

Equities: around 64% of firms in the MSCI AW index are, for example, currently publishing carbon reduction pledges. These data gaps mean that any aggregate carbon emissions projections for the equities component of a portfolio require estimation via heuristics (problem-solving short-cuts) – e.g., assuming that the emissions of firms that don't issue decarbonization pledges will grow by a given amount each year – which may turn out to be wrong.

The further future time horizons are extended, the more uncertainty around the accuracy of emissions predictions grows. Broadening the scope of carbon emissions measured (see discussion on Scopes 1, 2 and 3 above) will also add to forecast uncertainty.



Fixed income: around 61% of total debt issuance is accounted for by government bonds and 18% comes from agencies, local authorities and supranational. The remaining 21% is in the form of corporate credit.

On **corporate debt** we can get reasonable clarity on most issuing firms through their published carbon-reduction commitments. Aside from the size of the market, there may be other reasons to include corporate bonds in a portfolio decarbonization strategy e.g., the ability of bondholders to exert influence over firms' priorities before or at the point of issuance. There has also been continued growth in global green, sustainability and social bond markets where proceeds are put to specific use, with the OECD expecting debt-related instruments to lead the way on transition finance.⁶

Carbon emissions data on **sovereign bonds** is more difficult. It is possible to look at the carbon intensity of the economy relative to GDP, at an aggregate country level. But carbon emissions in a country will include emissions from corporates as well as government-related entities. This introduces a problem of "double-counting" of emissions in any emissions calculation, in that you will already be accounting for corporate emissions in other asset classes (equities and bonds). In other sovereign bonds assessments (e.g. ASCOR), the focus is really on climate risk rather than carbon reduction carbon commitments.

Other asset classes (e.g. derivatives investments and alternatives) are currently out of scope for a systematic decarbonization strategy, given the usual lack of publicly-reported decarbonization targets.

#5

- Choosing between "active" and "passive" investment approaches will involve multiple factors and some potential compromises.
- Implication: Mix "active" and "passive" approaches as appropriate.

Investment vehicles

Investors face an apparent choice between managing individual securities ("active" management) and buying pre-defined index-type vehicles ("passive"). Many decarbonization portfolios will combine the two. Investors may need to accept some compromises with passive vehicles.

Which **investment vehicles** should you use to pursue your overall decarbonization objective? One choice is between managing individual investment holdings within a portfolio and buying index type investment vehicles ("active" vs. "passive" investment). The latter can be designed to follow a specific decarbonization pathway (e.g. exchange-traded funds based on CTB/PAB discussed above).

However, an investor here may have to accept some **potential compromises**. An ETF with a decarbonization target may, for example, include sectors which an ESG investor does not want to include in their portfolio for other reasons (e.g. social considerations), possibly making it difficult to hit both decarbonization targets and other portfolio management agreements.



- Not investing at all in specific sectors can be a blunt tool, could affect portfolio performance and be counterproductive in encouraging the sustainability transition.
- Implication: don't rely on exclusions, focus on transition.

Exclusions

Exclusions of sectors and subsectors are a blunt tool and need to be used carefully. In addition to changing a portfolio's return/risk characteristics, they may also be counterproductive in aiding the overall transition towards sustainability. In many portfolios, we would aim for a more sector-neutral approach.

The practice of excluding certain sectors or subsectors (e.g. hydrocarbons firms) from investment has a long history within environmental or socially-targeted investment. However, within a decarbonization portfolio, exclusions can be a blunt tool and need to be considered carefully, not least because they can change a portfolio's return/risk characteristics. The impact of exclusions will be dependent on the measure used. But, in general, exclusions based on decarbonization measures may tilt a portfolio away from emerging markets (in particular Asia) and towards developed markets. Similarly, they may reduce exposure to energy, materials and utilities while increasing exposure to sectors such as healthcare and financials.

Exclusions also bring us back to the question of what exactly a portfolio is for. If a portfolio is focused on the future, will exclusions help or hinder the process of transition to a sustainable low-carbon economy? It may not make sense to completely exclude investment in the energy sector, for example, if the growth in renewables promises to have a positive impact on global decarbonization. Our focus would therefore be on trying to tilt towards carbon-efficient/ promising names within a sector rather than automatically excluding all firms in high carbon-emitting sectors.

The ability to replace individual investments with others with better decarbonization metrics may be limited by the lack of alternatives and portfolio management considerations.

Implication: tilt to names with more promising decarbonization metrics where practical.

Switching

We would focus on tilting towards the most carbon-efficient firms in a sector, but the ability to switch investments may be limited by the availability of alternatives or other practical factors.

Switching involves changing individual holdings within a sector, to those with better decarbonization metrics (e.g. "best in class"). Switching tactics will depend on available metrics, investor aims, costs and, crucially, the ability to find credible investment alternatives (that are not ruled out for investment for other reasons).

Switching individual investments, like sectoral exclusions, may also have some knock-on effects for the portfolio's composition and management. Removal of firms will, for example, require reweighting of remaining holdings. It may also be necessary to have self-imposed limitations on switching strategies for cost or risk reasons.



#8

 Screening for decarbonization targets will reduce the investment universe, may skew portfolio composition, hence, some room for flexibility may be advisable.

 Implication: set investment restrictions but ensure/ maintain flexibility.

Performance

Screening for decarbonization targets at an individual investment level will reduce the investable universe with implications for portfolio composition and financial performance. Some room for flexibility around targets may be advisable.

Changing a portfolio's composition to meet a decarbonization objective, e.g., through exclusions and switching, will have an impact on its expected financial returns and risk profile. Some complex decarbonization strategies may also involve extra costs.

An additional factor here is how a decarbonization strategy restricts the available **investment universe**. This will depend on how the decarbonization objective is pursued, the degree of flexibility allowed around this objective, and how the overall real economy decarbonization is progressing.

Restrictions can be large but not insuperable. As an example, the table below shows the share of companies currently assessed by MSCI that meet given implied temperature rise (ITR) targets. If your ITR target is <2.0°C, for example, the share is 34%. (If you were selecting from Deutsche Bank Private Bank's pre-screened ESG stocks, this share would increase to 41%.)

Impact of using ITR filter on size of investment universe

Based on the total number of companies assessed by MSCI on an ITR basis. No. of companies shows the number of companies that would still be eligible for investment under each temperature rise scenario.

Implied temperature rise (ITR)	No. of companies	% of companies
\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark
<1.5°	748	7%
<2.0° - >1.5°	3,152	27%
<3.5° - >2.0°	5,219	46%
>3.5°	2,343	20%
Total	11,462	100%

Source: Deutsche Bank AG, MSCI. Data as of July 2024.

This is not just a matter of reducing the number of securities you can invest in. As discussed under Factor #3, applying an ITR requirement can skew a **portfolio's sector composition**, away (for example) from sectors such as energy and materials and towards sectors such as financials and healthcare, with different investment characteristics. The regional composition might also change.



These restrictions are imposed by your own objectives. There is room for flexibility, even within a stated long-term target (if, for example, you do not require a portfolio to exactly meet stated decarbonization targets every year). Restrictions may also ease if the overall global economy continues to decarbonize, so increasing the share of firms that meet stated ITR targets.

#9

- Decarbonization will require different shortterm management of financial risks but could help reduce longer-term transition risks, e.g. around stranded assets.
- Implication: consider impact of decarbonization on different types of climate risk.

Risks

Decarbonization may change the financial risks characteristics of a portfolio requiring different risk management. It may help reduce longer-term risks associated with the sustainability transition, e.g., stranded assets. It may also help portfolios anticipate market repricing of some sectors.

As noted above, the decarbonization process may change the financial return and risk characteristics of a portfolio (e.g., via changed sectoral weightings), requiring some rethinking of short-term portfolio risk management.

Decarbonization may, however, help reduce longer-term risks associated with climate change and the move to a lower-carbon world. These include **stranded assets**, physical assets which are no longer viable due to regulation or changing patterns of demand. Writing these down could have a significant impact on the value of individual and sectoral portfolio holdings.

The forecast numbers here are large, if imprecise. The International Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), for example, forecasts USD1–4 trillion in stranded fossil fuel assets between 2015-2050 if global warming is limited to 2°C.⁷ The Carbon Tracker thinktank projects >USD1 trillion in stranded oil and gas assets if warming is limited to 1.5°C, out of which around USD600bn is held by listed companies.⁸

A related question is to what extent financial markets will anticipate future change and reprice individual asset classes/sectors. A range of studies are already exploring this issue (e.g., the extent of the "greenium" on sovereign bonds⁹, trends in yield spreads on bonds issued by high carbon-emitting industries¹⁰ and the possible impact on firm-level equity returns of changes in emissions levels).¹¹ Clear answers to these questions are unlikely but our working assumption is that, ceteris paribus, moving portfolios onto a lower carbon emissions pathway will help reduce transition risks.



#10

- Portfolios will require ongoing optimization in line with real-world decarbonization and changing regulation.
- Implication: expect ongoing portfolio optimization and focus on investment outcomes within regulatory guardrails.

Optimization and regulation

Portfolios may require readjustment for operational reasons, progress in real economy decarbonization and to reflect different climate change scenarios. Debates around regulation will continue, with growing regional divergence possible.

Progress towards the decarbonization objective will not be in a straight line, is unlikely to be consistent, and may require **readjustment** of multiple factors during the lifetime of the portfolio. (For example, to increase liquidity, lower costs, improve diversification, enhance yields or reduce operational complexity, improve portfolio climate profile.)

Market understanding of the impact of decarbonization market returns/risk will change over time and we may also need to consider different climate change outcome scenarios.¹² We think, however, that the main decarbonization technologies and methods have now probably been identified and we do not expect a radical change in direction here.

In addition, future changes in **regulation** could impact the financial products available for inclusion in a portfolio, as well as the broader social and investor debate, and require portfolio adjustment. One recent example of this was the May 2024 final decision by the European Securities and Markets Authority (ESMA) on the application of fund names using ESG or sustainability-linked terms. Regulation debates may also not reach firm conclusions and there is the potential for regulatory divergence between regions (e.g. on product labelling).

The debate here Is likely to continue: for example, there is an ongoing debate around the possibility of defining transition investing as a category, e.g., through the review of the Sustainable Finance Disclosures Regulation, with potentially major implications for transition investments such as energy. Hence, the ESMA fund name guidelines are only one component of the European picture (with regulation from individual EU members and the UK) and further regulation is possible in other regions. Regional divergence in labelling requirements could become increasingly challenging.



Conclusion

So what, in reality, should a portfolio with decarbonization in focus look like? In summary, we think it is likely to be characterized as follows:

- use relative emissions measures to manage the portfolio (Factor #1);
- be largely **forward-looking**, with an emphasis on targets and pathways (Factor #2);
- complement binary targets with benchmarking of overall progress and components (Factor #3);
- be **data-intensive** in assessing equities and corporate credit asset classes (Factor #4);
- realize that choices between investment vehicles may require compromises (Factor #5);
- be focused on transition investment, rather than over-rely on sectoral exclusions (Factor #6);
- so tilt where possible to the most carbon-efficient/promising names within a sector (Factor #7);
- understand implications of reduced **investment universe** and need for target flexibility (Factor #8);
- consider how decarbonization could impact **risks** associated with the sustainability transition (Factor #9);
- and will **evolve** over time, reflecting operational optimization, real-world decarbonization and regulatory change (Factor #10).

We believe that the structural and management issues discussed above can be addressed within decarbonization portfolios, and that such portfolios are likely to prove attractive to many investors on purely economic grounds.

Sources

¹Occasional Study - Misleading Footprints_final (dnb.nl)

- ² The Paris Agreement | UNFCCC
- ³ Net Zero Tracker | Welcome
- ⁴Climate-Benchmarks_Overview-Booklet_200122.pdf (unepfi.org)
- ⁵ Transition planning | Glasgow Financial Alliance for Net Zero (gfanzero.com)
- ⁶ OECD Guidance on Transition Finance: Ensuring Credibility of Corporate Climate Transition Plans | en | OECD
- ⁷ https://www.ipcc.ch/report/ar6/wg3/
- ⁸ https://carbontracker.org/reports/unburnablecarbon-ten-years-on/
- ⁹ The Benchmark Greenium by Stefania D'Amico, Johannes Klausmann, N. Aaron Pancost :: SSRN
- ¹⁰ Climate Regulatory Risks and Corporate Bonds by Lee Seltzer, Laura T. Starks, Qifei Zhu :: SSRN
- ¹¹ https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3563271
- ¹² NGFS Scenarios Portal



Glossary

A **benchmark** is a defined variable to which a value or result can be compared.

Benchmark divergence is the extent to which a forecast or actual outcome diverges from the benchmark.

"Best in class": something that is the best of its kind, on a given measure.

Binary target: a pre-defined target that is clearly hit or missed.

Carbon dioxide: a chemical compound (CO₂) that when emitted to the atmosphere is a contributor to climate change.

Carbon footprint: a measure of carbon emissions (CO_2) relative to another given measure, for example a firm's capital value, but many different comparators are possible.

Climate change: a term used to describe climatic shifts during the earth's history, for example the current global warming and its impacts.

A **Climate Transition Benchmark** includes objectives on greenhouse gas emissions and the transition to a low carbon economy, used to select and verify components of the benchmark.

Corporate credit is debt issued by a corporation.

Decarbonization is the process of reducing carbon emissions by a corporate, other body, government or country.

Decarbonization pathway is the route over time by which a body plans to reach a long-term decarbonization objective.

Derivatives are financial contracts the price of which is dependent on underlying assets.

Diversification refers to the dispersal of investments across industries, asset types, regions and so on with the aim of reducing portfolio risk or boosting risk-adjusted returns.

Equities are shares in the ownership of companies, traded on public exchanges or privately.

The European Securities and Markets Authority (ESMA) is an official EU regulator of financial markets and products.

Exclusion, in an investment context, refers to excluding certain sorts of investment from a portfolio, often for non-financial reasons.

Greenium refers to the difference in pricing between sustainable debt instruments and non-sustainable instruments.

Greenhouse gas emissions from human activities include carbon dioxide, methane, nitrous oxide and other gases.

Implied temperature rise (ITR) is a methodology used to calculate if the carbon emissions of companies (or investment funds or portfolios) are in line with meeting global temperature goals.

Investment universe refers to the range of investments that can be included in a portfolio.

MSCI is an independent financial services provider of market indices and other analytical tools.

The **MSCIAC World Index** tracks the performance of around 1,600 large- and mid-cap stocks across 23 developed- and 23 emerging-market countries.

NZAOA (the Net-Zero Asset Owner Alliance) is a UN-convened group of institutional investors.

Optimisation is an ongoing process of maintaining the best possible portfolio, for example via asset selection, to pursue a given objective.

The **Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)** has 35 member countries and has the objective of encouraging economic progress and world trade.

Paris Agreement refers to a 2015 agreement under the framework of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change.



Glossary

Paris-Aligned Benchmark (PAB) indices are established under EU regulations intended to define a pathway to meet the 1.5°C temperature rise goal.

Portfolio: a range of investments held by an individual or organisation.

Private markets are used to trade investments between firms or individuals without the use of a public exchange.

SBTi (the Science-Based Targets Initiative) is a corporate climate action organisation.

Sustainable transition means moving the global economy onto a more environmentally-sustainable model.

Switching is replacing individual investments in a portfolio with others, which can be done for non-financial reasons.

Sovereign bonds are debt issued by a national government.

Transition finance is the continued financing of countries and firms (existing and new) as part of the transformation to more a more sustainable economic model.

Weighting is adjusting the contribution of individual data points to a data set (e.g. index) to account for specific other factors.

Important note

General

This document may not be distributed in Canada or Japan. This document is intended for retail or professional clients only. This document is being circulated in good faith by Deutsche Bank Aktiengesellschaft, its branches (as permitted in any relevant jurisdiction), affiliated companies and its officers and employees (collectively, "Deutsche Bank").

This material is for your information only and is not intended as an offer, or recommendation or solicitation of an offer to buy or sell any investment, security, financial instrument or other specific product, to conclude a transaction, or to provide any investment service or investment advice, or to provide any research, investment research or investment recommendation, in any jurisdiction, but is intended solely for information purposes. The information does not replace advice tailored to the individual circumstances of the investor.

All materials in this communication are meant to be reviewed in their entirety.

If a court of competent jurisdiction deems any provision of this disclaimer unenforceable, the remaining provisions will remain in full force and effect. This document has been prepared as a general market commentary without consideration of the investment needs, objectives or financial circumstances of any particular investor. Investments are subject to market risks which derive from the instrument or are specific to the instrument or attached to the particular issuer. Should such risks materialise, investors may incur losses, including (without limitation) a total loss of the invested capital. The value of investments can fall as well as rise and you may not recover the amount originally invested at any point in time. This document does not identify all the risks (direct or indirect) or other considerations which may be material to an investor when making an investment decision.

This document and all information included herein are provided "as is", "as available" and no representation or warranty of any kind, express, implied or statutory, is made by Deutsche Bank regarding any statement or information contained herein or in conjunction with this document. To the extent permissible under applicable laws and regulations, we are making no representation as to the profitability of any financial instrument or economic measure. All opinions, market prices, estimates, forward looking statements, hypothetical statements, forecast returns or other opinions leading to financial conclusions contained herein reflect Deutsche Bank's subjective judgment as of the date of this document. Without limitation, Deutsche Bank does not warrant the accuracy, adequacy, completeness, reliability, timeliness or availability of this communication or any information in this document and expressly disclaims liability for errors or omissions herein. Forward looking statements involve significant elements of subjective judgments and analyses and changes thereto and/or consideration of different or additional factors could have a material impact on the results indicated. Therefore, actual results may vary, perhaps materially, from the results contained herein.

Unless otherwise indicated in this document, all statements of opinion reflect the current assessment of Deutsche Bank, which may change at any time. Deutsche Bank does not assume any obligation to either update the information contained in this document or inform investors about available updated information. The information contained in this document is subject to change without notice and based on a number of assumptions, estimates, opinions and



hypothetical models or analyses which – although, From the Bank's current point of view are based on adequate information – may not prove valid or turnout in the future to be accurate or correct and may be different from conclusions expressed by other departments within Deutsche Bank. Although the information contained in this document has been derived from sources that Deutsche Bank considers trustworthy and reliable, Deutsche Bank does not guarantee the completeness, fairness, or accuracy of the information and it should not be relied upon as such. This document may provide, for your convenience, references to websites and other external sources. Deutsche Bank takes no responsibility for their content and their content does not form any part of this document. Accessing such external sources is at your own risk.

To the extent permissible under applicable laws and regulations, this document is for discussion purposes only and is not intended to create any legally binding obligations on Deutsche Bank and Deutsche Bank is not acting as your financial advisor or in a fiduciary capacity unless otherwise expressly agreed by Deutsche Bank in writing. Before making an investment decision, investors need to consider, with or without the assistance of a financial professional, whether any investments and strategies described or provided by Deutsche Bank, are appropriate, in light of the investor's particular investment needs, objectives, financial circumstances, the possible risks and benefits of such investment decision. When making an investment decision, potential investors should not rely on this document but only on what is contained in the final offering documentation relating to the investment. As a global financial services provider, Deutsche Bank from time to time faces actual and potential conflicts of interest. Deutsche Bank's policy is to take all appropriate steps to maintain and operate effective organisational and administrative arrangements to identify and manage such conflicts. Senior management within Deutsche Bank are responsible for ensuring that Deutsche Bank's systems, controls and procedures are adequate to identify and manage conflicts of interest. Deutsche Bank does not give tax or legal advice, including in this document, and nothing in this document should be interpreted as Deutsche Bank providing any person with any investment advice. Investors should seek advice from their own tax experts, lawyers. and investment advisers in considering investments and strategies described by Deutsche Bank. Unless notified to the contrary in a particular case, investment instruments are not insured by any governmental entity, not subject to deposit protection schemes and not guaranteed, including by Deutsche Bank. This document may not be reproduced or circulated without Deutsche Bank's express written authorisation. Deutsche Bank expressly prohibits the distribution and transfer of this material to third parties. Deutsche Bank accepts no liability whatsoever arising from the use or distribution of this material or for any action taken or decision made in respect of investments mentioned in this document which the investor may have made or may make in the future.

The manner of circulation and distribution of this document may be restricted by law or regulation in certain countries, including, without limitation, the United States. This document is not directed to, or intended for distribution to or use by, any person or entity who is a citizen or resident of or located in any locality, state, country, or other jurisdiction where such distribution, publication, availability or use would be contrary to law or regulation or which would subject Deutsche Bank to any registration or licensing requirement within such jurisdiction not currently met. Persons into whose possession this document may come are required to inform themselves of, and to observe, such restrictions. Past performance is no guarantee of future results; nothing contained herein shall constitute any representation, warranty, or prediction as to future performance. Further information is available upon investor's request.

Deutsche Bank AG is a stock corporation ("Aktiengesellschaft") incorporated under the laws of the Federal Republic of Germany with its head office in Frankfurt am Main. It is registered with the district court ("Amtsgericht") in Frankfurt am Main under number HRB 30 000and licensed to carry out banking business and to provide financial services. Supervisory authorities are the European Central Bank ("ECB"), Sonnemannstrasse 22, 60314 Frankfurt am Main, Germany (www.ecb.europa.eu) and the German Federal Financial Supervisory Authority ("Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht" or "BaFin"), Grauheindorfer Strasse 108, 53117 Bonn and Marie-Curie-Strasse24-28, 60439 Frankfurt am Main (www.bafin.de), and by the German Central Bank ("Deutsche Bundesbank"), Wilhelm-Epstein-Strasse 14, 60431 Frankfurt am Main (www.bundesbank.de).

This document has neither been submitted to nor reviewed or approved by any of the above or below mentioned supervisory authorities.

For Residents of the United Arab Emirates

This document is strictly private and confidential and is being distributed to a limited number of investors and must not be provided to any person other than the original recipient, and may not be reproduced or used for any other purpose. By receiving this document, the person or entity to whom it has been issued understands, acknowledges and agrees that this document has not been approved by the UAE Central Bank, the UAE Securities and Commodities Authority, the UAE Ministry of Economy or any other authorities in the UAE. No marketing of any financial products or services has been or will be made from within the United Arab Emirates and no subscription to any funds, securities, products or financial services may or will be consummated within the United Arab Emirates. This does not constitute a public offer of securities in the UAE Securities in accordance with the Commercial Companies Law, Federal Law No. 2 of 2015 (as amended from time to time) or otherwise. This document may only be distributed to "Professional Investors", as defined in the UAE Securities and Commodities Authority's Rulebook on Financial Activities and Reconciliation Mechanism (as amended from time to time).



For Residents of Kuwait

This document has been sent to you at your own request. This presentation is not for general circulation to the public in Kuwait. The Interests have not been licensed for offering in Kuwait by the Kuwait Capital Markets Authority or any other relevant Kuwait igovernment agency. The offering of the Interests in Kuwait on the basis a private placement or public offering is, therefore, restricted in accordance with Decree Law No. 31 of 1990 and the implementing regulations thereto (as amended) and Law No. 7 of 2010 and the bylaws thereto (as amended). No private or public offering of the Interests is being made in Kuwait, and no agreement relating to the sale of the Interests will be concluded in Kuwait. No marketing or solicitation or inducement activities are being used to offer or market the Interests in Kuwait.

For Residents of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia

This document may not be distributed in the Kingdom except to such persons as are permitted under the Investment Fund Regulations issued by the Capital Market Authority. The Capital Market Authority does not take any responsibility for the contents of this document, does not make any representation as to its accuracy or completeness, and expressly disclaims any liability whatsoever for any loss arising from, or incurred in reliance upon, any part of this document. Prospective subscribers of the securities should conduct their own due diligence on the accuracy of any information relating to securities. If you do not understand the contents of this document, you should consult an authorised financial adviser.

For Residents of Qatar

This document has not been filed with, reviewed or approved by the Qatar Central Bank, the Qatar Financial Markets Authority, the Qatar Financial Centre Regulatory Authority or any other relevant Qatari governmental body or securities exchange or under any laws of the State of Qatar. This document does not constitute a public offering and is addressed only to the party to whom it has been delivered. No transaction will be concluded in Qatar and any inquiries or applications should be received, and allotments made, outside Qatar.

For Residents of the Kingdom of Bahrain

This document does not constitute an offer for sale of, or participation in, securities, derivatives or funds marketed in Bahrain within the meaning of Bahrain Monetary Agency Regulations. All applications for investment should be received and any allotments should be made, in each case from outside of Bahrain. This document has been prepared for private information purposes of intended investors only who will be institutions. No invitation shall be made to the public in the Kingdom of Bahrain and this document will not be issued, passed to, or made available to the public generally. The Central Bank (CBB) has not reviewed, nor has it approved, this document or the marketing of such securities, derivatives or funds in the Kingdom of Bahrain.

For Residents of South Africa

This document does not constitute or form a part of any offer, solicitation or promotion in South Africa. This document has not been filed with, reviewed or approved by the South African Reserve Bank, the Financial Sector Conduct Authority or any other relevant South African governmental body or securities exchange or under any laws of the Republic of South Africa.

For Residents of Belgium

This document has been distributed in Belgium by Deutsche Bank AG acting though its Brussels Branch. Deutsche Bank AG is a stock corporation ("Aktiengesellschaft") incorporated under the laws of the Federal Republic of Germany and licensed to carry on banking business and to provide financial services subject to the supervision and control of the European Central Bank ("ECB") and the German Federal Financial Supervisory Authority ("BaFin"). Deutsche Bank AG, Brussels Branch, is also supervised in Belgium by the Financial Services and Markets Authority ("FSMA", www.fsma.be). The branch has its registered address at Marnixlaan 13-15, B-1000 Brussels and is registered under number VAT BE 0418.371.094, RPM/RPR Brussels. Further details are available on request or can be found at www.deutschebank.be.

For Residents of the United Kingdom

This document is a financial promotion as defined in Section 21 of the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000 and is approved by and communicated to you by DB UK Bank Limited. DB UK Bank Limited is a member of the Deutsche Bank group and is registered.at Company House in England & Wales with company number 315841 with its registered Office: 21 Moorfields, London, United Kingdom, EC2Y 9DB. DB UK Bank Limited is authorised by the Prudential Regulation Authority and is regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority and the Prudential Regulation Authority. DB UK Bank Limited's Financial Services Registration Number is 140848. Deutsche Bank Aktiengesellschaft is incorporated in the Federal Republic of Germany and its members' liability is limited.

For Residents of Hong Kong

This material is intended for: Professional Investors in Hong Kong. Furthermore, this material is provided to addressee only, further distribution of this material is strictly prohibited. This document and its contents are provided for information only. Nothing in this document is intended to be an offer of any investment or a solicitation or



recommendation to buy or to sell an investment and should not be interpreted or construed as an offer, solicitation, or recommendation.

The contents of this document have not been reviewed by any regulatory authority in Hong Kong. You are advised to exercise caution in relation to the investments contained herein (if any). If you are in any doubt about any of the contents of this document, you should obtain independent professional advice.

This document has not been approved by the Securities and Futures Commission in Hong Kong ("SFC"), nor has a copy of this document been registered by the Registrar of Companies in Hong Kong, unless specified otherwise. The investments contained herein may or may not be authorised by the SFC. The investments may not be offered or sold in Hong Kong, by means of any document, other than (i) to "professional investors" as defined in the Securities and Futures Ordinance (Cap. 571 of the Laws of Hong Kong) ("SFO") and any rules made under the SFO, or (ii) in other circumstances which do not result in the document being a "prospectus" as defined in the Companies (Winding Up and Miscellaneous Provisions) Ordinance (Cap. 32 of the Laws of Hong Kong)(the "C(WUMP)O") or which do not constitute an offer to the public within the meaning of the C(WUMP)O. No person shall issue or possess for the purposes of issue, whether in Hong Kong or elsewhere, any advertisement, invitation or document relating to the investments, which is directed at, or the contents of which are likely to be accessed or read by, the public of Hong Kong (except if permitted to do so under the securities laws of Hong Kong) or only to "professional investors" as defined in the SFO and any rules made under the SFO.

For Residents of Singapore

This material is intended for: Accredited Investors / Institutional Investors in Singapore. Furthermore, this material is provided to addressee only, further distribution of this material is strictly prohibited.

For Residents of the United States of America

In the United States, brokerage services are offered through Deutsche Bank Securities Inc., a broker-dealer and registered investment adviser, which conducts securities activities in the United States. Deutsche Bank Securities Inc. is a member of FINRA, NYSE and SIPC. Banking and lending services are offered through Deutsche Bank Trust Company Americas, member FDIC, and other members of the Deutsche Bank Group. In respect of the United States, see earlier statements made in this document. Deutsche Bank makes no representations or warranties that the information contained herein is appropriate or available for use in countries outside of the United States, or that services discussed in this document are available or appropriate for sale or use in all jurisdictions, or by all counterparties. Unless registered, licensed as otherwise may be permissible in accordance with applicable law, none of Deutsche Bank or its affiliates is offering any services in the United States or that are designed to attract US persons (as such term is defined under Regulation S of the United States Securities Act of 1933, as amended). This United States-specific disclaimer will be governed by and construed in accordance with the laws of the State of Delaware, without regard to any conflicts of law provisions that would mandate the application of the law of another jurisdiction.

For Residents of Germany

This information is advertising. The texts do not meet all legal requirements to ensure the impartiality of investment and investment strategy recommendations or financial analyses. There is no prohibition for the compiler or for the company responsible for the compilation to trade with the respective financial instruments before or after the publication of these documents.

General information on financial instruments is contained in the brochures "Basic Information on Securities and Other Investments", "Basic Information on Financial Derivatives", "Basic Information on Forward Transactions" and the information sheet "Risks in Forward Transactions", which the customer can request from the Bank free of charge. Past performance or simulated performance is not a reliable indicator of future performance.

For Residents of India

The investments mentioned in this document are not being offered to the Indian public for sale or subscription. This document is not registered and/or approved by the Securities and Exchange Board of India, the Reserve Bank of India, or any other governmental/regulatory authority in India. This document is not and should not be deemed to be a "prospectus" as defined under the provisions of the Companies Act, 2013 (18 of 2013) and the same shall not be filed with any regulatory authority in India. Pursuant to the Foreign Exchange Management Act, 1999 and the regulations issued there under, any investor resident in India may be required to obtain prior special permission of the Reserve Bank of India before making investments outside of India including any investments mentioned in this document.

For Residents of Italy

This report is distributed in Italy by Deutsche Bank S.p.A., a bank incorporated and registered under Italian law subject to the supervision and control of Banca d'Italia and CONSOB. Its registered office is located at Piazza del Calendario 3 – 20126 Milan (Italy) and is registered with the Chamber of Commerce of Milan, VAT and fiscal code number 001340740156, part of the interbank fund of deposits protection, enrolled in the Bank Register and the head of



Deutsche Bank Banking Group, enrolled in the register of the Banking Groups pursuant to Legislative Decree September 1st, 1993 n. 385 and subject to the direction and coordination activity of Deutsche Bank AG, Frankfurt am Main (Germany).

For Residents of Luxembourg

This report is distributed in Luxembourg by Deutsche Bank Luxembourg S.A., a bank incorporated under the laws of the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg in the form of a public limited company (Société Anonyme), subject to the supervision and control of the European Central Bank ("ECB") and Commission de Surveillance du Secteur Financier ("CSSF"). Its registered office is located at 2, boulevard Konrad Adenauer, 1115 Luxembourg, Grand Duchy of Luxembourg and is registered with Luxembourg Registre de Commerce et des Sociétés ("RCS") under number B 9.164.

For Residents of Spain

Deutsche Bank, Sociedad Anónima Española Unipersonal is a credit institution regulated by the Bank of Spain and the CNMV and registered in their respective Official Registries under the Code 019. Deutsche Bank, Sociedad Anónima Española Unipersonal may only undertake the financial services and banking activities that fall within the scope of its existing license. The principal place of business in Spain is located in Paseo de la Castellana number 18, 28046 - Madrid. Registered in the Mercantile Registry of Madrid, Volume 28100, Book 0, Folio 1, Section 8, Sheet M506294, Registration 2. NIF: A08000614. This information has been distributed by Deutsche Bank, Sociedad Anónima Española Unipersonal.

For Residents of Portugal

Deutsche Bank AG, Portugal Branch is a credit institution regulated by the Bank of Portugal and the Portuguese Securities Commission ("CMVM"), registered with numbers 43 and 349, respectively and with commercial registry number 980459079. Deutsche Bank AG, Portugal Branch may only undertake the financial services and banking activities that fall within the scope of its existing license. The registered address is Rua Castilho, 20, 1250-069 Lisbon, Portugal.

For Residents of Austria

This document is distributed by Deutsche Bank AG Vienna Branch, registered in the commercial register of the Vienna Commercial Court under number FN 140266z. Deutsche Bank AG's Vienna branch is also supervised by the Austrian Financial Market Authority (FMA), Otto-Wagner-Platz 5, 1090 Vienna. This document has neither been submitted to nor approved by the aforementioned supervisory authorities.

For Residents of the Netherlands

This document is distributed by Deutsche Bank AG, Amsterdam Branch, with registered address at De entree 195 (1101 HE) in Amsterdam, the Netherlands, and registered in the Netherlands trade register under number 33304583 and in the register within the meaning of Section 1:107 of the Netherlands Financial Supervision Act (Wet op het financieel toezicht). This register can be consulted through www.dnb.nl.

For Residents of France

Deutsche Bank AG is an authorised credit institution, subject to the overall supervision of the European Central Bank and BaFin, the German Federal Financial Supervisory Authority. Its various branches are locally supervised, for certain activities, by the competent banking authorities, such as the Prudential Control and Resolution Authority (Autorité de Controle Prudentiel de Résolution, "ACPR") and the Financial Markets Authority (Autorité des Marchés Financiers, " AMF") in France.

Any reproduction, representation, distribution or redistribution, in whole or in part, of the contents of this document in any medium or by any process whatsoever, as well as any sale, resale, retransmission or making available to third parties in any manner whatsoever, is prohibited. This document may not be reproduced or distributed without our written permission.

© 2024 Deutsche Bank AG. All rights reserved.

Puplication date: August 22, 2024

Image credit: lovelyday12 (Adobe Stock)

055507 082224